

---

**11. LISTED BUILDING APPLICATION - CONVERSION OF REDUNDANT BUILDINGS TO ESTATE HOUSE, BROOMHEAD FARM. BOLSTERSTONE (NP/S/0807/0736. P.4563. 06.08.07. 2440 9623/KW)**

**APPLICANT; THE BROOMHEAD ESTATE**

Broomhead Farm is situated on the edge of Broomhead Moor 200m east of Mortimer Road and 5km northwest of High Bradfield. It comprises a farm cottage, together with a nearby detached impressive range of grade II listed courtyard of farm outbuildings. A public footpath passes 30m to the north of the farm complex.

The Broomhead Estate extends to over 2,363 hectares (5,840 acres), centred on Broomhead. Approximately 1,516 hectares (3,746 acres) comprises open moorland managed for grouse shooting and encompassing Broomhead, upper Commons and Barnside Moors. A large part of the Estate is designated SSSI, including all the moorland area. The moorland is also a designated Special Protection Area (SPA) and a Special Area of Conservation (SAC).

**Proposal**

Conversion of the North and West Blocks of the courtyard listed farm outbuildings to an Estate House incorporating a shooting lodge with a number of bedrooms to accommodate those visiting the Estate for shooting purposes. The scheme also involves the conversion/adaption of the single-storey East Block to form a garden room, restoration of a fire-damaged section of the South Block and adjacent pigsties and removal of a modern corrugated sheet roof, which currently covers part of the yard to the south side of the South Block.

**Key Issues**

1. Whether the proposed scheme conserves the character and setting of the impressive range of grade II listed courtyard of farm buildings.

**Relevant Planning History**

1973 - Planning consent granted for the demolition of Broomhead Hall and outline consent granted for the erection of a replacement dwelling on the site of the demolished Hall. Broomhead Hall was a large Tudor Gothic nineteenth century mansion that was the original family home of the owners of the Broomhead Estate. It was situated to the south of the South Block of the courtyard buildings. The Hall was not considered to be of any great architectural merit and was in an advanced state of decay. The Hall was subsequently demolished, however, the reserved matters application for the replacement dwelling was never submitted and the outline permission therefore lapsed.

1976 - Broomhead Hall and the Stable Block grade II listed.

1977 - Listed Building Consent granted for the demolition of Broomhead Hall, the demolition works finally being completed in 1981.

1987 - Consent granted for the erection of a stock shelter in former walled garden adjacent to the Stable block Buildings.

1996 - Refusal of GDO Notification for the erection of a sheep building on land to the east of the Stable Block buildings on grounds that the building would seriously harm the setting of the listed buildings, and would also harm the character of the historic garden and parkland which is associated with the former hall. A subsequent appeal was dismissed.

1998 - GDO Notification granted for demolition of greenhouse and removal of topsoil and hard

surfacing within the walled garden area to the west of the Stable Block buildings.

2003 - Informal discussions concerning the conversion of the Stable Block buildings to an Estate House or the replacement of the single-storey East Block with a two-storey dwelling. The applicants were advised that these options would be unacceptable in listed building terms and also in planning terms, as there appeared to be no strong justification for a further dwelling.

November 2006 - letter to agent advising that the proposed conversion of the Stable Block buildings to an Estate House with guest accommodation for visitors could not be supported by officers. This was because there was considered to be no overriding need for the dwelling sufficient to warrant an exception to the adopted Conservation and Housing policies. Whilst it was recognised that it would be an advantage for the applicant, as the estate owner and overall manager of the estate, to be on site officers were unconvinced that this could be regarded as essential. Concerns were also raised in respect of the intensive conversion of the listed Stable block buildings and the resultant compromising of the character and setting of the grade II listed buildings. The applicant was advised that any proposal would need to primarily demonstrate the lack of the Estate manager's presence would have a detrimental effect upon the management of the estate and a consequent adverse effect upon the long term conservation and management of the National Park landscape.

### **Consultations**

Highway Authority - No comments.

City Council - No comments.

Parish Council - Recommends approval and supports local economy.

Environment agency - No objections.

English Heritage - This application should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance, and on the basis of the Authority's specialist conservation advice.

Hallamshire Historic Buildings Society - The proposal is in full accord with the Government's Planning Policy Guidance 15, paragraphs 2.18 and 3.8. The presence of a permanent resident is a primary consideration as too many historical and vernacular buildings have fallen foul of vandalism and neglect due to lack of 24-hour security and have faded from the landscape. In this particular case, it is imperative that the stables and outbuildings of Broomhead Hall be saved from the fate of the Hall itself, considering that there has been a building on this site for hundreds of years. Care has been taken to refurbish the exterior of the buildings and internal alterations are considerate of the existing style of the building.

Natural England - The accompanying bat survey shows evidence of bat species being present. Require clarification of the precise bat mitigation measures to be provided, such details to be provided prior to permission being granted. Appropriate conditions should then be attached to ensure that the bat mitigation measures are implemented.

Friends of the Peak District - Wishes to register its support for the proposal as it would help achieve the following objectives;

- Sympathetically preserve the former stables which are grade II listed;
- Sustain viable rural employment; and
- Sustain a business, which maintains 3,746 acres of valued heather moorland.

The conversion to guest and private accommodation (for employees of the shooting business) is appropriate in this case, as it will provide a sustainable use for the buildings. Strongly support

the intention to use ground-sourced heat pumps, wood burning stoves and possibly a biomass heater using wood from the estate) to provide hot water and heating. The proposal will also ensure the long-term viability of the Estate, which employs 60 people (full and part time) and makes a significant contribution to the local economy. The proposal will also ensure that the heather moorland is maintained as a habitat for grouse. The heather moors at Broomhead are designated SSSI and their preservation is essential. Due to these environmental and economic benefits, it is considered that the proposal is consistent with Structure Plan policy GS1 as it will conserve and enhance the valued characteristics of the National park and its statutory purposes (conservation and promoting enjoyment). It will also bring economic benefits and therefore well-being to the local community. As there is no conflict between these objectives, the Authority is encouraged to approve this proposal.

### **Main Policies**

Relevant Regional Spatial Strategy policies include: Policies 10, 11 and 30 in the draft RSS 8

Relevant Structure Plan policies include: GS1, C2, C6, C7, C9, C14, C17, HC1, RT1, RT3, T1

Relevant Local Plan policies include: LC4, LC6, LC8, LC12, LC14, LR1, LR6, LT11

### **Comment**

The planning policy issues concerning the principle of the conversion are considered in detail in the accompanying planning application, which is discussed in the previous item. The key issue in respect of this listed building application concerns whether the proposed scheme conserves the character and setting of the impressive range of grade II listed courtyard of farm buildings.

This is an impressive range of buildings. The two-storey buildings (North, South and West wings) enclose three sides of a square with a single -storey outbuilding on the east side of the yard. The proposed estate house/shooting lodge accommodation is confined mainly to the North and West (mid 19<sup>th</sup> Century) wings. The South wing (early 19<sup>th</sup> Century) is a more formal design. The central grand archway is the main entrance to the yard. It would have faced the Hall (now demolished). This wing is not to be converted except for one room at first floor over the garages in the southwest tower. The southwest tower was burnt down in 2006 following a break-in. This building is to be fully reinstated and the remainder of the South wing is to be refurbished to its original state.

The North and West wings are well provided with window openings in both storeys and consequently little change to the external appearance is required. A new round window is proposed in the North wing. There is an existing first floor throughout all wings. It is intended that the ground floor accommodation should not be subdivided to any great extent so that the internal space remains in view. In the North wing (Guest accommodation) fully glazed cross-walls are proposed, allowing a full-length view of the whole ground floor space. The original large south archway into the North wing was unfilled with stonework and the full-height space inside lost when the first floor was installed. It is proposed to restore these two features. The smaller archway on the north side will also be opened up to give a view straight through the building. The original stone slate roofing was replaced a man-made concrete slates 60 years ago, supported on lightweight steel-angle roof trusses. It is proposed to re-roof with natural gritstone slates supported on new timber king post trusses exposed fully in the Entrance Hall. The horizontal collars of the trusses will be exposed in all rooms below flat ceilings. The flat ceilings will be insulated to reduce total space-heating requirements and the CO<sub>2</sub> emissions of the building. The creation of large, dark loft spaces will also be highly beneficial to the natterer bats, which were observed during the recent bat survey.

The scheme also involves the removal of three 20<sup>th</sup> Century additions to the buildings comprising a large corrugated asbestos Dutch barn (floor area 220m<sup>2</sup>, overall height 9.5m) which abuts the

north side of the North Wing; a metal-sheeted lean-to roof (floor area 120m<sup>2</sup>, overall height 3.5m) that abuts the south side of the South Wing and a small lean-to shed (floor area 18m<sup>2</sup>, overall height 3.5m) in the south west corner of the yard. The removal of these buildings will significantly enhance the appearance and setting of the listed buildings.

The originally submitted scheme also involved the demolition of the single-storey building which presently encloses the eastern side of the courtyard and the demolition of a range of pigsties to the south of the South Wing. The Authority's Historic Buildings Architect, however, raised concerns about their removal as these buildings are of some merit and contribute to the character of the listed building group. Satisfactory amended plans have now been submitted retaining these buildings and in the case of the building on the eastern side of the courtyard, adapting it to provide a garden room with views through the building from the inner courtyard to the open countryside to the east of the complex.

Policy C9 of the Structure Plan states that the effective conservation of all buildings of historic or vernacular merit will be pursued by ensuring that they continue to be used for purposes suited to the conservation of the buildings themselves and to their locations. Development, which adversely affects the particular merits of such a building, will not normally be permitted. Conversion of listed agricultural buildings to residential use, including holiday accommodation other than a camping barn will not normally be permitted. Policy LC6 of the Local Plan states that planning applications for development affecting a listed building and/or its setting should clearly demonstrate how these will be preserved and enhanced and why the proposed development and related works are desirable or necessary. Amongst other things, development will not be permitted if it would adversely affect the character, scale, proportion, design, detailing of, or materials used in the listed building. Additionally, proposed development should not result in irreversible change to original features or other features of importance or interest. In particular, development will not be permitted if it would directly, indirectly or cumulatively lead to, amongst other things, changes to the plan form that involve removal of original walls, stairs or entrances or subdivision of large interior spaces. The loss of curtilage features which complement the character and appearance of the listed building will not be permitted.

In this particular case, this is an impressive range of listed buildings that are largely redundant to agriculture. Whilst there is inevitably some loss in character, particularly due to the subdivision of the internal spaces on the first floor, the scheme requires few new openings externally and involves the removal of untraditional buildings that will significantly improve the appearance and setting of the listed complex. Additionally, the oldest part of the courtyard (South Wing) is to remain unaltered and stone slate roofs are to be re-instated, together with a traditional timber roof construction appropriate to the age of the buildings. Ancillary buildings are also to be retained. On balance it is considered that this is a sympathetic scheme, which is considered to be acceptable from a listed building viewpoint. Whilst initially raising concerns about the scheme, particularly the proposed removal of curtilage buildings, the Authority's Historic Buildings Architect now considers that the overall enhancement of the listed building complex is sufficient to justify the acceptance of the proposal.

The scheme also involves the re-opening of the original gateway entrance off the Strines to Midhopstones Road at the south-western end of the Broomhead Hall grounds, together with the re-instatement of the 530m long driveway that leads to the front of the South Wing. This is considered to be acceptable, subject to appropriate detailing and the drive being surfaced with a dark-coloured material.

### **Environmental Management**

The building's ground floor, external walls and roof, are to be highly insulated in line with the latest Building Regulations. Heating is proposed to be provided using ground-sourced heat pump, subject to satisfactory ground conditions, supplemented by wood-burning stoves and a biomass boiler, if necessary, using wood from the Estate. There will be natural ventilation to all

rooms: no air conditioning is to be provided. Bathrooms and kitchens are to be fitted with extract fan to satisfy the Building Regulations. The Estate is also intending to investigate the possibility of a mini hydro-electricity scheme In Broomhead Park, using the Park Brook to provide part of the electrical supply to the new Lodge.

### **Human Rights**

Any human rights issues have been considered and addressed in the preparation of this report.

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

**That the application be APPROVED, subject to the following conditions:**

- 1. Agree amended plans.**
- 2. Minor design conditions.**
- 3. Submit and agree details of re-opened gateway and re-instated drive works (including surfacing details).**
- 4. Submit and agree appropriate energy conservation measures.**

Footnote: Bats

List of Background Papers (not previously published)

Nil